EUROPEAN
ENDOWMENT FOR DEMOCRACY

Narrative Report

Contract number: <u>6828002/2013/008</u>

Name of the Organization: Public Movement Multinational Georgia

Name of the Person filling in the Report: Dimitri Tsertsvadze, Executive Director

Period covered by the report: 30-10-2013/31-12-2013

1. Main Objectives of the Activity

<<Please restate briefly what are the main objectives you are trying to achieve while implementing the Activity>>

The main objective of the action was to deliver assistance to the elections observer organization "Public Movement Multinational Georgia" in the conduction of post-election activities as well as evaluation of the 2013 Presidential Election Monitoring program.

In addition, the action also implied the appropriation of additional financial support to the implementation other components of the election monitoring program including translation of program related materials in Russian, Armenian, Azerbaijanian and English languages, as well as publication of final report which were not financially supported by other donors.

2. Description of Project Activities Carried Out During the Reporting Period

Activity 1:	Conducted Organizational retreat for Election Observation Program Performance Evaluation Purposes
Location:	Signagi, Hotel "Solomon 1805"
Number of participants/beneficiaries (if any):	20
Description:	Public Movement Multinational Georgia has organized the retreat in Signagi to measure its performance during Presidential Elections as well as identify the strong and weak sides of the program for better planning and implementation of future activities. <u>Day 1: 17 November, 2013</u>

	Event type: Meeting of the PMMG project staff with District Logistics Coordinators (DLC) and District Election Commission (DEC) observers Day 2: 18 November, 2013 Event type: Meeting of the PMMG project staff for project performance evaluation purposes
Main products (if any):	Obtained findings regarding the quality of implementation of the elections monitoring program as well as developed concrete recommendations on how to improve the performance of the elections monitoring program

Activity 2:	Conducted Elections Monitoring Program evaluation meetings with program Short Term Observers (STOs), Mobile Group Observers (MGOs) and Central Election Commission (CEC) observer
Location:	Tbilisi, Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions
Number of participants/beneficiaries (if any):	Up to 150 observers taking part in the meetings
Description:	The project staff members have organized the series of Elections Monitoring Program evaluation meetings with program Short Term Observers (STOs), Mobile Group Observers (MGOs) and Central Election Commission (CEC) observer in order to share their views and visions regarding the strong and weak sides of the program as well as their recommendations on how to better plan and implement the similar action for the upcoming 2014 Local Governmental Elections.
Main products (if any):	Obtained findings regarding the quality of implementation of the elections monitoring program as well as developed concrete recommendations on how to improve the performance of the elections monitoring program

Activity 3:	Submission and processing of complaints in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions

Location:	Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions
Number of participants/beneficiaries (if any):	3 members of the project team
Description:	The project team members paid visits to the respective electoral districts of Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions in order to file and submit complaints to the District Election Commissions and the Courts as well as impose monitoring over the adjudication of complaints
Main products (if any):	Upon the completion of the Election Day monitoring mission PMMG head office has submitted 195 complaints to the respective district election commissions requesting the annulment of the PEC protocols. Moreover, 21 additional complaints have been submitted to Akhaltsikhe district election commission. 21 complaints have been satisfied from the total number of filed complaints while 69 have been satisfied partially. 12 decision of the district election commission have been protested and the respective number of complaints has been submitted to the courts.

3. Assessment of Activities' Results

<<Please assess in this section the main achievements and difficulties you have been facing while implementing the activities listed above. What are the indicators you are basing yourself on to assess your results? What are the major successes of the activities implemented? Are there any unexpected positive outcomes/benefits? What are the challenges you met and did they have an impact on the implementation of the activities? >>

<u>**Activities 1 and 2:**</u>

- Conducted Organizational retreat for Election Observation Program Performance Evaluation Purposes in Signagi, Hotel "Solomon 1805"
- Conducted Elections Monitoring Program evaluation meetings with program Short Term Observers (STOs), Mobile Group Observers (MGOs) and Central Election Commission (CEC) observers

The organizational retreat as well as evaluation meetings allowed PMMG to identify strong and weak sides of its Election Monitoring Program in order to make respective changes / possible alterations to the future activities to be specially designed and implemented for elections monitoring purposes.

Positive and Negative Aspects of the monitoring mission

As compared with the previously implemented elections monitoring programs the positive aspects of Presidential Elections were that PMMG management was more organized and coherent, its work was better systematized and the functions among the employees were well distributed.

Despite the fact that PMMG from the beginning did not welcome the idea of inculcation of 4 level testing of observer's (recruitment, post trainings testing, verbal test and simulation) finally it turned out that this comprehensive process helped the organization to select better observers' than it had in the previous years. Also observers were positive about testing because they passed difficult stages.

It was the first time when PMMG conducted simulation for observers and operators and database testing as well. As it was mentioned during the workshop simulation helped to eliminate problems prior to e-day.

All the events' participants underlined the fact that observers' forms, manuals and guidelines were well-developed and improved; materials decreased possibility of someone doing their job wrong.

Internal and external communication was better. Statements and press-release templates were elaborated in advance. This helped PR manager to plan the job more rationally.

Despite positive aspects, some problematic areas have been identified which need to be corrected for future elections. One of the negative aspects of the implemented observation mission was the fact that PMMG did not conducted pre-election monitoring. According to international standards for elections monitoring, observation groups have to observe each and every stage of the election to be able to assess the entire process. Therefore, expending its observation with pre-Election Day monitoring is PMMG's key area for improvement. In general pre-election monitoring is carried out via LTOs; for the next time, PMMG needs to think about recruiting and training them. Main weakness is that PMMG is having limited experience and knowledge in conducting pre-election monitoring via LTOs. In case it gets funds for future elections in order to conduct pre-election monitoring, PMMG needs methodological assistance in carrying out this activity.

Another weakness was the fact that PMMG did not carry out E-day monitoring with the statistically representative methodology - PMMG did not have sample and thus it could not extrapolate E-day information to the entire minority population. For next time PMMG should be thinking about sampling and additionally if the sample skips some problematic PSs it's possible to cover them by mobile groups.

The communication among central office staff and field observers could be better explained to all headquarter and regional staff and better implementation of the defined communication

system should be secured. In addition external strategy should be longer with more focus on securing space for PMMG information in traditional media.

Fundraising

Retreat participants came up to the conclusion that more works need to be conducted with the donors to secure funding for election monitoring programs. Moreover, PMMG didn't develop its observation strategy in cascade system - ideal one, where all desired activities are outlined, medium and minimum that covers necessary activities for successful observation mission. PMMG will develop such a cascade system (strategy) in order to effectively raise funds for the next elections.

For the Presidential Elections PMMG did not conduct Pre-election monitoring via LTOs. This is weakness part in terms of election monitoring. For the next elections PMMG wants to conduct pre-election monitoring and it is going to put this activity in the budget line. It depends how much funds PMMG can get but as it is planned at least 9 LTOs will operate through Samtsjkhe-Javakheti, Kvemo Kartli and Kakheti regions.

In order to increase quality of the E-day observation mission PMMG plans to cover all the electoral precincts with the compact settlement of ethnic minority groups. However, in case of shortage of financing it will chose the precincts based on random sampling. Sample size will be defined by the available resources. Extra travel costs for covering sampled precincts needs to be foreseen in the budget as well.

PMMG will develop a cascade observation strategy that will be aimed to secure minimum funds for comprehensive observation mission but also priorities how to utilize additional funds if they appear.

Following bullet points were defined for future improvement:

- Creation of Master Budget where clearly will be defined how much funds are needed for basic, better and ideal mission. For organization it is necessary to have cascade strategy in order to plan better activities;
- Venues for trainings can be improved;
- Simulation costs - operators' reimbursement has to be foreseen;
- Communication funds for observers were not enough and should be increased;
- Prior E-day the organization has a lot of stuff to do and staff members have to stay at office until late. Therefore, PMMG might envisage the hotel rent costs near the office; but in case the organization recruits more logistics assistants than the project staff will not need to stay at the office for the whole nights;
- Costs for shooting promotional videos;
- Costs for PR, for more promotional materials;
- Costs for complaint litigation;
- Costs for DLC and LTO trainings;
- Training for trainers should be considered in the budget;

- PMMG should budget up to 5 workshops to conduct management/planning sessions.

Recruitment

PMMG program management efficiency has been substantially improved as compared with the previous years. Despite the fact that PMMG had different recruitment strategy for Presidential Elections than previous one, despite the fact that all observers' passed 4 level testing process, several cases of unprofessional STOs appeared.

Central office staff recruitment:

Generally recruitment of central office staff should start earlier. For instance, after the first open announcement organization would not be able to select proper candidate, it's possible to announce second call for applications.

Before having interview with the candidate PMMG team passed several steps: elaborating job description, open call announcement, select resumes, develop testing questions, provide test, evaluate test results and based on it conduct interviews. For interview it's also necessary to have list of questions with possible answers and scores that was missing this time.

Trainers' recruitment:

It's necessary to find other ways how to find individuals with training experience, subject knowledge, language skills and ability to completely commit themselves to work with PMMG for that period.

The problem related to a couple of trainers' knowledge appeared. Also, timing and problem of being available appeared. As it was mentioned it's possible to recruit trainers from those observers who had worked well for this mission.

District Logistics Coordinators' (DLC), District Election Commission (DEC) and Mobile Groups (MG) observers' recruitment:

- Despite the fact that DLCs and MG observers had their own functions according to the guidelines it appeared that sometimes DLCs and MGs work was overlapping. Functions of DLCs and MGs should be divided in better way, responsibilities pre-defined and people should be selected accordingly;
- In the future PMMG should pay more attention to the Georgian language knowledge by observers and DLCs. Bad knowledge or complete absence of state language skills prevents submitting complaints, as DEC does not accept complaints written in other language;
- Mobile Groups basically drive around precincts that are not covered by STOs; DEC observers who are not highly loaded during voting process can help out STOs in writing complaints.

Operators' recruitment

Call center operators' were well selected, but for the future activities several recommendations can be taken in account:

- Prepare operators in STO form structure and content to make them understand information they are inserting into web-enable database that will minimize inaccuracy and will enable them to check data immediately.
- The typing speed of operators was not perfect, but not bad
- If PMMG wants more speedy flow of information than it needs to increase the number of operators, up to at least 20 people
- It's better giving possibility to the operators' to rotate in shifts, so that work quality does not decrease due to people being tired.

Administrative Activities

In general administrative activities have been properly planed by PMMG. However, there have been some shortcomings. It should be mentioned that the most problematic issue was preparing materials for observers' as well as development of observers' deployment plan. Other logistical problem was that some observers' turned off their phones once back to Tbilisi and it was impossible to reach them to check data.

Necessary improvements for future elections are:

- PMMG needs more time prior to election day for logistics and observation materials distribution; observer lists should be entered to the spreadsheet in parallel with trainings because it always takes lot of time;
- Organization should earlier distribute materials, and later change the remaining things. Distributing remaining small number of materials is easier than to wait for all observers to confirm attendance;
- PMMG needs separate staff for training logistics - logistics person, another one who would deal with other training issues. Trainings take lots of resource - two logistics assistants are not enough;
- The election observation mission structure should be created that describes division of duties. PMMG needs to create super-clear structure, written out - when, who does what and how;
- It's important to remember that those different responsible people should have frequent communication among themselves;
- Internal double-check is needed to ensure that trainings are being conducted well (internal audit/monitoring/quality control). Create training monitoring form to document and compare trainings of different pairs;
- Trainings' quality control tool should be developed and trainers should write training report;
- New application form needs to be developed including information about where STOs are from, where they prefer to be deployed, their factual and registration address, all phones,

language, etc.). This time the language assessment should be described in qualitative terms (how well they know the language, not only which language they know);

- Observers' forms and instructions need to be updated (due to new legislation) - designated person is needed for this duty.

Technical resources/devices

It appeared that technical resources should be improved:

- The head phones are needed for operators (PMMG bought 8 but couldn't use because they were not applicable to the existing phones);
- For these elections cell phones were bought, but for the next time it's planned to buy better phones as those bought were not of enough quality for good communication;
- PMMG needs extra computers;
- PMMG needs new printers for timely printing documentation for observers' pack;
- PMMG needs photo cameras.

Trainings

Trainings were improved in comparison with the last year. The Observers' Pledge that STO's were made to sign during the trainings was positively evaluated and it is planned to continue the practice during the future elections. The materials, such as forms and manuals were said to be improved in comparison with the last year.

However, there is a necessity for the improvement prior to the upcoming 2014 local elections, specifically:

- During the trainings writing complaints component should be paid more attention. This year for many observers it was still difficult to write complaint in a proper way;
- The main issue for ToT training is that the lawyers should have been given more time for explaining the complaints during the ToT;
- For next election monitoring ToT trainings and trainer's should be included into the budget;
- Methodology of the MG, DEC and DLC training should be modified (more focus on legal aspects, complaints, post-election monitoring) - people should be taught more practical things they are expected to perform;
- Operators should have attended the STO training or otherwise be more informed of the STO form structure and content.

Development of observers' forms and manuals

During the events it was mentioned that STO manual was too large, but after the discussion it was decided to leave all the sections in the manual, because good manual should cover all election related topics.

To do list:

- Make more simpler DEC observer form;
- DEC complaint log form needs simplification;
- For upcoming elections PPTs should be made according to the existing forms;
- Ask/receive information/evaluation from the involved observers or conduct pilot testing of forms if time permits

Technological aspects of the mission

Operators' program (database) was very user-friendly. This was the first time when PMMG used special program in order to collect and process the information reported by the STOs. Despite the fact that everyone liked the program, still it's possible to make improvement of it, for instance:

- News notifications when something is added to the database, like Facebook has (people don't have to manually go through the database in order to find there new information);
- One of the problematic issues was that information from the hotlines did not go to the database and if it was received from PMMG observer, information was manually entered by other person;
- All people involved in the process should be able to see/have access to the database;
- It should be discussed and made decision on how to combine the work of lawyer (legal advice) and work of operator (entering info);
- The STO form can have special graph where it is separated out - which violation was verbally followed up and which violation was written complaint upon;
- Many observers said they couldn't report at specific times due to observing important ongoing processes at the polling station. Perhaps timing of reporting can be changed.

Phone SIM Cards

The workshop participants' evaluated technical aspects of communication system. As it was mentioned during the meeting communication funds were not enough for calls. Some observers had beeline phones (which only operate with beeline SIM cards), while PMMG purchased only Magti SIM cards. The positive aspect was that there were not observed problems in terms of mobile operator geographical coverage.

Additionally it was mentioned that new mobile phones are needed for upcoming elections.

Internet and Electricity back ups

For emergency cases, PMMG had two cable-free Internet sticks (one Magti, one Geocell), but this sticks were expensive. Organization had internet and electricity back up plans and in case of necessity they were ready to use generator and UPSs.

To do list:

- Space for call center was too small. It's necessary to rent somewhere new space for call center set up;

STO Simulation (Reporting Process and Quality of Reporting)

Events' participants mentioned that it was really very good that PMMG conducted simulation. This process gave possibility to test database, operators' work and observer's readiness for elections. The simulation was conducted for the first time and PMMG plans to have it for future elections as well. As a result of the simulation, a number of problems were identified and feedback was received from the users.

All STOs were informed about the simulation in advance, during STO trainings. In simulation process observers from the back up list took part as well. The reporting information was written in the STO manuals and a day prior the simulation all observers' were told which exact part they had to report to the call center.

The list of needed improvements:

- STOs should be given money for communication;
- Give scenarios to observers ahead (instead of using the scenario/example in the manual);
- Simulation time should be close to the real e-day reporting time, so that there are no confusion;
- Database designer should attend simulation, in case if someone from participants have questions.

Communication

Internal Communication

Despite the fact that internal communication strategy was defined in advance and each staff member, especially those who were in the field knew their functions E-day showed that several problems emerged and communication strategy still needs improvement.

Each observer, MG, DLC, DEC should know that in case they cannot reach the operator, they need to wait a bit and later try to reach call center again. For this elections constant phone communication was among central office and those who were in the field. But sometimes it appeared that there was some information about critical situations/incidents that was not entered in the database, just because that the information was not given to the proper person. Also, when STO's were reporting information about incidents to the call center, they did not give this information to their DLCs. Therefore, sometimes DLCs did not fully know what was going on PECs.

The list of needed improvements:

- Internal communication instructions should be more specified and clarified for observers;

- Each STO, DLC, MG and DEC should behave according to the instructions and rules related the communication system.

External Communication

Comparing with previous years, PMMG media coverage for this year was better. All templates for E-day, press-releases and statements were prepared in advance, also, PPT on E-day, visuals and videos. PMMG web page was updated and the new information was uploaded in timely manner. As it was mentioned PMMG hired PR too late. For the next time PMMG needs to start earlier communication activities with different partners and media. If PMMG has pre and post-election monitoring mission for the future elections, it means that organization will need PR for the longer duration. In general external communication strategy has to be developed at least two and half months prior to E-day and its implementation should start at least two months prior to E day.

Activities that need improvement for the future elections:

- External communication planning went effectively but time-management was difficult due to late start. PR needs to start working process much earlier than it was now;
- The media should get more information about PMMG. It appeared that some of them did not have proper perception about the organization. Media communication needs improvement;
- It should be reviewed what information was announced to the media on E-day and update templates according it;
- Facebook activities - adds should be considered
- PR had little time for visuals. It's necessary to work with designer on E-day visuals;
- On E-day PR needs better time management in order not to waste time;
- PMMG needs English language translator on E-day;   it's possible to change press-conference timing;
- If a training for media representatives will be held this will improve the relations with them;
- To create brochures and guidelines for media on "how to cooperate" will be good;
- After awareness of organization is boosted, other PR events will be cheaper to do (free participation in talk shows, etc.);
- Database of emails should be improved;
- Web-page needs improvement. PMMG website is not structured well and therefore, it's difficult to find relevant information on the webpage.

Election Day

As it was mentioned during the events better division of duties would have led to the more effective workflow on the Election Day. For this purpose, PMMG definitely needs more staff members in the central office. The retreat participants have listed out the different functions that need to be performed / divided among the staff members and the list of new staff members:

- 3 lawyers, operators (1 operator per 20 observer), call center manager, 2 assistants (divided according the languages skills), hot line operator, analyst, IT, the day before the elections - there could be two non-staff members who could manage the logistics (distribution of materials, transportation) so that staff is rested for the election day;
- The lawyers should be divided according to regions and they need to have access to that part of the database where is given information about incidents. Thus this will give possibility to them to update information in the database according to information they will receive during the E-day;
  - E-day revealed language knowledge problems and if the observer is really very good, mobile group can help such observer in complaint writing or other duties.

Complaints

For Presidential Elections PMMG, comparing with the previous years, wrote better quality complaints, they were written in more professional way that gave opportunity to the organization to win cases even in courts.   But everyone mentioned that one main lawyer and his assistant was not enough for taking lead on all complaints.

The list of needed improvements:

- The first of all lawyers' needs to know PMMG strategy - which cases are important and what is complaint writing priority;
- Response to violations: timeliness - more initiative is needed from lawyers;
- Response to complaints was very good, but needs further improvements;
- Organization should have in the budget more funds for litigation costs. Due to the fact that there was lack of such costs, PMMG could not appeal all the complaints in the court as well.
- Some violations are being fixed as a result of verbal advice; some require complaint - it should be clearly written out, how does observer behave in each cases

Follow Up Activities

During the events PMMG listed all activates that should be carried out after the elections:

- Budget figures according to cascade strategy should be elaborated;
- Create master budget accordingly;

- Decision needs to be made on the conduction of long-term monitoring (LTO) (approximately: 1 person in each district, 2 months, total of 12 people);
- LTO planning should start (if positive decision is made);
- Cascade strategy should be ready as soon as possible to be ready for potential financing from donors.
- Action plan should be prepared by January latest;
- HQ staff labor division should be elaborated, identify gaps to hire people;

Recommendations:

- Create election observation specific strategic plan;
- Prepare more and earlier-better time management;
- Observers should be constantly involved - in other projects as well;
- Recruit additional staff members during elections;
- Renewal of the webpage (structure the webpage in more logical way);
- To conduct pre and post-election monitoring;
- Hire PR for the long term and have longer communication strategy;
- Managers should start implementing plan without delays.

General conclusion

- PMMG needs to develop cascade observation strategy (max, mid and min) and strategically communicate it to donors well in advance in order to avoid delays in activity implementation
- PMMG needs to observer the entire process which does not mean just Election Day but also pre and post-election periods. Pre and post-election observation strategies should be developed and comprehensive trainings for PMMG observers should be conducted
- While preserving four level testing system including E-day simulation for selecting observers, PMMG needs to develop more comprehensive recruitment criteria for other staff and recruit them more in advance in order to avoid possible delays in strategy implementation
- PMMG needs more time prior to Election Day for deployment and material preparation and distribution. PMMG will consider forming tentative deployment for logistic purposes and later make last minute changes
- Some qualified trainers should be added to improve the quality of capacity building programs. DEC, DLC and MG trainings should be added. Manual should be more simplified.
- Data collection database should have notification system and more clear connection in between STO and incident forms.
- Internal communication needs to be better explained to all staff involved in the observation effort, including observers and in particular what to do in case they can't reach call-center

- External communication needs to start way earlier and PR manager should be hired at least three months prior to E-day. More focus should be put on raising awareness about PMMG and securing PMMG presence in traditional media. Online advertisement tools should be considered (e.g. FB adds)
- PMMG needs more staff in the headquarter on the election day and needs bigger space to accommodate the entire central office machinery
- More lawyers should be hired to accommodate complaints process.
- The number of DEC and MG observers should be increased to meet the mounting challenges on the E-day.

Activity 3: Submission and processing of complaints in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions

Upon the completion of the Election Day monitoring mission PMMG head office has submitted 195 complaints to the respective district election commissions requesting the annulment of the PEC protocols. Moreover, 21 additional complaints have been submitted to Akhaltsikhe district election commission.

The complaints have been filed on the following grounds:

Precinct election commission seal did not have any marks as required by the law:

- N39 Aspindza electoral district (ED), N02, N04 electoral precincts (EP);
- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N02 EP;
- N 39 Marneuli ED, N57, N62 EP ;
- N 40 Akhalkalaki ED, N48, N28, N09, N63 EP;
- N23 Bolnisi ED, N11, N15, N43, N48, N55, N58 EP;
- N21 Gardabani ED, N12 EP;
- N 22 Marneuuli ED, N 53 EP;
- N41 Ninotsminda ED, N21 EP;
- N25 Tsalka ED, N20, N13, N33, N35, N02, N45, N37 EP;
- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N33 EP;
- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N22 EP.

Precinct election commission seal had only one mark as required by the law:

- N21 Gardabani ED, N52 EP;
- N 22 Marsneuli ED, N9 EP;
- N41 Ninotsminda ED, N02 EP;
- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N29 EP.

Some blocks were not filled in the precinct election commission summary protocol:

- N39 Aspindza ED, N02, N12, N15, N17, N18, N19 EP;
- N 37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N25 and N19 EP;

- N40 Akhalkalaki ED, N70, N67, N66, N37,N04, N03, N02, N01, N68, N45, N16, N30, N12, N64, N55, N50, N10,N27, N14, N43, N28, N62, N57, N48 EP;
- N 23 Bolnisi ED, N1, N2, N3, N05, N8, N20, N25, N30, N33, N37, N38, N39, N40, N43, N50, N51, N52, N55, N58, N59, N60, N61 EP;
- N 36 Borjomi ED, N08, N10, N15, N21, N22, N24 EP;
- N21 Gardabani ED, N12, N04, N26 EP;
- N22 Marneuli ED, N01; N06, N08; N10, N13; N14; N15; N19; N20; N24; N25; N27; N36; N39; №40; N41; N42; N49; N50; N51; N55; N56; N57; N58; N59; N60; N62; N63; N68; N72; N78; N82; N83; N84; N12; N09; N38; N87; N16; N33; N65; N73; N77; N23 EP;
- N41 Ninotsminda ED, N22, N02, N27, N05, N06, N23, N14, N09, N20, N26, N34, N01, N10, N07 EP;
- N25 Tsalka ED, N39, N38, N32, N29, N27, N24, N22, N17, N16, N04, N05, N11, N15, N20, N33, N27, N31, N42 EP.

The attempt of hijack of election documentation from district election commission:

- N39 Aspindza ED

The copy of the summary protocol does not correspond to the original:

- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N02, N13, N27 and N31 EP;
- N40 Akhalkalaki ED, N2 EP
- N36 Borjomi ED, N17 EP;
- N21 Gardabani ED, N12 EP;
- N22 Marneuli ED, N11, N18, N30, N43, N44, N47 and N66 EP;
- N41 Ninotsminda ED, N22, N02, N27, N06, N23, N30 and N21 EP;
- N 23 Bolnisi ED, N49 and N59 EP;
- N25 Tsalka ED, N44, N03, N42 EP.

Summary protocol was not affirmed by the seal:

- N 40 Akhalkalaki ED, N43 EP;
- N 22 Marneuli ED, N33 EP.

The revision protocol attached to the summary protocol was not affirmed by the seal:

- N22 Marneuli ED, N72 EP.

Influence on the head of PEC and commission members from the side of political party:

- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N10 EP.

The number of ballots in the box exceeded the number of signatures of the registered voters:

- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N10 EP.

The presence of more number of representatives of political subjects at the precinct as allowed by the law:

- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N21 EP;
- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED N5 EP.

21 complaints have been satisfied from the total number of filed complaints while 69 have been satisfied partially.

12 decision of the district election commission have been protested and the respective number of complaints has been submitted to the courts:

Precinct election commission seal did not have any marks as required by the law:

- N37 Akhaltsikhe ED, N02 EP
- N40 Akhalkalaki ED, N28 and N09 EP;
- N23 Bolnisi ED, N11, N15, N43, N48, N55, N58 EP.

The copy of the summary protocol does not correspond to the original:

- N22 Marneuli ED N30 EP.

Summery protocol was not affirmed by the commission seal:

- N 22 Marneuli ED, N33 EP.

The revision protocol attached to the summary protocol was not affirmed by the seal:

- N22 Marneuli ED, N72 EP.

The court has satisfied all 3 complaints regarding the decision made by Marneuli district election commission. None of the complaints has been considered submitted to Bolnisi, Akhaltsikhe and Akhalkalaki courts due to the expiration of the appeal time.

4. Foreseen activities that could not be implemented

<<If any of the foreseen activities could not be implemented please list them here and explain what prevented you from doing so>>

All the planned activities have been realized in due manner meeting the highest expectations of the action as well as project team.

5. Financial Management

<<Were all the activities implemented as per the contract budget and financial management expectations? If not, please identify and explain where significant savings or over-expenditures occurred and why>>

In general - Yes, with the only exception: 345 Gel was used for publication certificates for observers from the budget line 5.7 "Publication of the final report", however this slight change did not affect producing of the initially envisaged amount of reports.

6. Risk Management

<<What challenges or constraints did you meet while implementing the activities (legal, partnership, contracting, logistical, operational etc.)? Where these challenges anticipated prior to the implementation? How were these challenges addressed? What specific measures would you take to address risks in the future for similar initiatives?>>

All the activities implemented within the framework of the action did not entail any type of risks which would hinder the proper realization of the stated objective.

7. Gender Issues

<<How have the activities acknowledged and addressed the different needs of women, men, boys and girls? Describe the measures taken to ensure that the interests/needs of women, men, boys and girls were addressed? Please consider the following:

a) **Planning: What gender inequalities were recognized within the context of the project and how were they addressed within the activities?**
b) **Implementing: How were the needs/interests of women, men, boys and girls addressed by project activities?**
c) **Evaluating: How did women, men, boys and girls benefit from the advantages/gains of implemented activities? Provide concrete examples to the extent possible.>>**

The Election Monitoring Program did not entail addressing the specific needs and constraints faced by male or female representatives of different societal groups. However, it has to be noted that an entire monitoring program has largely addressed the gender issue: female representatives have been widely attracted as observers including STOs, MGO, DEC observers and CEC observer. In addition, most of program logistics coordinators represented women. Moreover, 99% of call center operators were women.

Additionally, comprehensive review of the observers' lists clearly demonstrates the perfect age balance satisfied by the action: half of the observers were the representatives of youth members of society.

8. Outreach and EED Visibility

<<Were the activities, outputs or achievements communicated? Through which channels? When relevant, please highlight any instances where EED's contribution was acknowledged.>>

Project obtained findings as well as developed recommendations have been widely communicated with local stakeholders including CEC, local and international observer organizations, foreign missions, state bodies and other civil societal bodies through different

types of publicity. PMMG has underlined the financial support and generous contribution made by the EED on all events.

All the events (including organizational retreat as well as meetings with observers) carried out within the framework of the proposed project have underlined the importance of EED funding and all the participants of the events highly welcomed such a generous support. In addition, the project produced Final Elections Report also indicates financial support of EED in line with other donors.

9. Non EED Funded Activities

<<If the activities under this contract are co-funded, please enter here a short description of non EED funded activities that have been undertaken during the reporting period>>

As has been underlined above EED funded activities represented the part of the complex Election Monitoring Program implemented by the PMMG with the support of other donors.

Such activities included:

1. STOs' manual, reporting and incident forms as well as respective reporting forms, incident forms and orientation guidelines have been developed for Mobile Group Observers, District Election Commission Observers and District Logistics Coordinators;
2. Internal and external communications plans have been developed;
3. Observers have been recruited;
4. Data base (web) has been developed;
5. Call center has been set up;
6. Respective logistics related works have been conducted for the conduction of ToT;
7. Respective works have been carried out for the conduction of capacity building training program for PMMG recruited observers;
8. Capacity building training program has been conducted for project recruited observers;
9. Training was conducted for call center operators;
10. Election day simulation was conducted for observers as well as call center operators;
11. Conducted Election Day observation mission in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions.

Detailed information cay be provided upon request.

Please list below all the Annexes provided together with this report (publications, participants' lists, meeting agenda etc.):

Annex 1: Final Elections Report in Georgian, English, Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages

Annex 2: Agenda, Organizational Retreat for Election Observation Program Performance Evaluation Purposes

Annex 3: Agenda, Elections Monitoring Program evaluation meetings with program Short Term Observers (STOs), Mobile Group Observers (MGOs) and Central Election Commission (CEC) observers

Report submitted by
(Full name, title, signature & date)

Arnold Stepanian, Chairman

14 January 2014

[For internal use only]

_____

Report approved by
(Full name, title, signature & date)

_____

EED approval by

(Full name, title, signature & date)

Annex 1

Public Movement Multinational Georgia

**Elections Monitoring Program evaluation meetings with program Short Term
Observers (STOs), Mobile Group Observers (MGOs) and Central Election Commission
(CEC) observers**

Issues for discussion:

Introduction:

An outline of the implemented action: general scope of observatory mission and overview of
realized activities

1. **Problems, challenges and shortcomings identified in a process of recruitment of short
   term observers, mobile group observers and district election commission observers**

Comments and suggestions regarding the quality and outcome of the conducted informational
outreach meetings in the respective regions / districts for the attraction of observers.
Deliberations over new methods and approaches to enhance the quality of observers'
recruitment process.

2. **Applicability, comprehensibility and relevancy of the Reporting forms** for static
   observers; Incident forms for static observers; Manual for static observers; Incident forms
   for mobile team observers; "What to do" guidance for mobile team observers; Reporting
   forms for District Election Commission observers; Manual for District Election
   Commission observers; Manual for District Logistics Coordinators; Incident Reporting
   form of District Logistics Coordinators.

Comments, ideas, suggestions and needs for further improvements of the forms and manuals

3. **Quality of observers capacity building program**

Technical, methodological and conceptual problems, shortcomings and challenges revealed
in a course of realization of capacity building program for observers. Detailed deliberation
over each aspect of the program: quality of delivery of electoral issues to the audience;
quality of trainers' performance; quality of logistical support of the program.

4. **Quality of observers Election Day deployment process**

Comments, ideas, suggestion and needs for further improvement of observers Election Day deployments plan including transportation and accommodation of observers. What worked / what did not? What needs to be changed or improved?

5. Quality of Election Day observation process

Identification of strong and weak sides of observers' works including static observers, mobile group observers and district election commission observers. Comments, ideas, suggestion and needs for further improvement of observers Election Day performance. What worked / what did not? What needs to be changed or improved?

Conclusions and recommendations

<u>**Annex 2**</u>

Public Movement Multinational Georgia

Organizational Retreat for Election Observation Program Performance Evaluation Purposes

Signagi, Hotel "Solomon 1805"

Day 1: 17 November, 2013

Event type: Meeting of the PMMG project staff with District Logistics Coordinators (DLC) and District Election Commission (DEC) observers

Issues for discussion:

Introduction:

An outline of the implemented action: general scope of observatory mission and overview of realized activities

1. **Problems, challenges and shortcomings identified in a process of recruitment of short term observers, mobile group observers and district election commission observers**

Comments and suggestions regarding the quality and outcome of the conducted informational outreach meetings in the respective regions / districts for the attraction of observers. Deliberations over new methods and approaches to enhance the quality of observers' recruitment process.

2. **Applicability, comprehensibility and relevancy of the Reporting forms** for static observers; Incident forms for static observers; Manual for static observers; Incident forms for mobile team observers; "What to do" guidance for mobile team observers; Reporting forms for District Election Commission observers; Manual for District Election Commission observers; Manual for District Logistics Coordinators; Incident Reporting form of District Logistics Coordinators.

Comments, ideas, suggestions and needs for further improvements of the forms and manuals to be communicated by the DLCs and DEC observers.

3. **Quality of observers capacity building program**

Technical, methodological and conceptual problems, shortcomings and challenges revealed in a course of realization of capacity building program for observers. Detailed deliberation

over each aspect of the program: quality of delivery of electoral issues to the audience; quality of trainers performance; quality of logistical support of the program.

4. Adequacy, frequency, depth and extent of communication between the project head office and DLCs and DEC observers

Comments, ideas, suggestions and needs for further improvement of internal communication plan. What worked / what did not? What needs to be changed or improved?

5. Quality of observers Election Day deployment process

Comments, ideas, suggestion and needs for further improvement of observers Election Day deployments plan including transportation and accommodation of observers. What worked / what did not? What needs to be changed or improved?

6. Quality of Election Day observation process

Identification of strong and weak sides of observers' works including static observers, mobile group observers and district election commission observers. Comments, ideas, suggestion and needs for further improvement of observers Election Day performance. What worked / what did not? What needs to be changed or improved?

Conclusions and recommendations

Closing of Workshop

Day 2: 18 November, 2013

Event type: Meeting of the PMMG project staff for project performance evaluation purposes

Issues for discussion:

Introduction:

An outline of the implemented action: general scope of observatory mission and overview of realized activities

1. Observation strategy and planning (general strategy, importance of planning process)

2. Fundraising (how strategically planned fundraising process was and what were mistakes of fundraising)

3. Recruitment (project staff, lawyers, PR, IT, Finances, Logistics, Administrative), regional representatives (DLC, MG, DC), trainers, call center operators, STOs)

4. Administrative activities (logistics, equipment, translation, software purchase and call center set up, materials (manual and observation forms) development, training deployment, trainings preparation security measures and back up plans)

5. Trainings (working on training module, development of training materials, conduction of trainings)

6. Development of forms and manuals

7. Technological aspects of the mission (database creation, use of software, phone cards effectiveness, internet back up, electricity backups, phone connection backups)

8. STO simulation (reporting process and quality of reporting)

9. Communication (internal - how well was coordinated among operators, STOs, DC, DLCs, MGs and project staff. external - PR work, timely publication of information, press-releases, statements, PPT, visuals, final statement, media policy of the organization)

10. E-day (labor division, timeliness of internal and external reporting, double check of data, follow up calls, critical/incident situation, consolations with lawyers, language coordination, timely response to violations, analyzing the data)

11. Complaint adjudication

12. follow up activities (STO division, Lawyers, PR, IT, Finances, Logistics and administration, Regional representatives, Court cases monitoring, Final report, Final presentation, Final debriefing)

13. Conclusions and recommendations

14. Closing of Workshop