

**JOB EVALUATION REPORT**

Fire and Police Commission: July 12, 2018

**Milwaukee Police Department**

Current	Recommendation
<p>EMERGENCY COMMUNICATIONS OPERATOR II PR 5IN (\$46,347 - \$57,001)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Career ladder pay progression steps</li> <li>• Additional 5% for intermittent peer training duties</li> <li>• \$58,711 and \$60,473 training assignment steps</li> <li>• \$60,992, \$64,218, and \$67,616 lead assignment steps</li> <li>• Recruitment flexibility with DER approval</li> <li>• 135 Positions</li> </ul>	<p>EMERGENCY COMMUNICATIONS OPERATOR PR 5IN (\$43,326 - \$57,001)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Career ladder pay progression steps</li> <li>• Additional 5% for intermittent peer training duties</li> <li>• \$58,711 and \$60,473 training assignment steps</li> <li>• \$60,992, \$64,218, and \$67,616 lead assignment steps</li> <li>• Recruitment flexibility with DER approval</li> <li>• 135 Positions</li> </ul>
<p>EMERGENCY COMMUNICATIONS OPERATOR I PR 5EN (\$40,501 - \$47,608)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Career ladder pay progression steps</li> <li>• Additional 5% for intermittent peer training duties</li> <li>• \$49,036 and \$50,507 training assignment steps</li> <li>• Recruitment flexibility with DER approval</li> </ul> <p>Underfill title</p>	<p>Footnote 36 incumbents that perform only call-taking responsibilities as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Range of \$40,501 - \$47,608</li> <li>• Career ladder pay progression steps</li> <li>• Additional 5% for intermittent peer training duties</li> <li>• \$49,036 and \$50,507 training assignment steps</li> </ul>

**Milwaukee Fire Department**

Current	Recommendation
<p>FIRE DISPATCHER PR 5IN (\$46,347 - \$57,001)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Career Ladder Pay Progression Steps</li> <li>• \$58,711 and \$60,473 Lead Assignment Steps</li> <li>• \$60,992 when assigned Fire Dispatcher–Senior duties</li> <li>• Recruitment flexibility with DER approval</li> </ul> <p>18 Positions</p>	<p>FIRE DISPATCHER PR 5IN (\$43,326 - \$57,001)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Career Ladder Pay Progression Steps</li> <li>• \$58,711 and \$60,473 Lead Assignment Steps</li> <li>• \$60,992 when assigned Fire Dispatcher–Senior duties</li> <li>• Recruitment flexibility with DER approval</li> </ul> <p>18 Positions</p>

**Background**

The Emergency Communications Operators (ECOs) in the Police Department and the Fire Dispatchers in the Fire Department are a critical component of the City of Milwaukee’s emergency response team. These positions are generally the first contact that victims of an emergency event have with the Police and Fire Departments. The Fire and Police Commission has made the decision to conduct a combined recruitment of Police and Fire Department 9-1-1 operators in 2018. This decision has been made based upon a number of factors including similarity in minimum experience and competencies at time of hire; efficient use of Fire and Police Commission and Police and Fire Department staff time and resources; and efficient use of applicant’s time.

As a result of this decision, La Keisha Butler, Fire and Police Commission Executive Director, has requested that Employee Relations conduct a study to align the minimum rates of pay for ECOs and Fire Dispatchers. In preparation for the report, staff met with representatives from the Fire Department, Police Department, Fire & Police Commission and Budget Office.

The most recent job evaluation reports for both Fire Dispatchers and the Emergency Communication Operators (ECOs) established career ladder pay progression. Career ladder pay progression is based on the combination of

performance reviews, call quality assessments, and the completion of training programs that further a 9-1-1 operator's knowledge, skills, and abilities. In addition, these latest reports recommended adjustments to the pay ranges for each of the titles based on competitive market rates of pay and for assumption of higher level duties, such as training and lead worker responsibilities.

This report recommends aligning the minimum rates of pay for Emergency Communication Operator and Fire Dispatcher positions while maintaining previous pay range and pay progression recommendations.

### Current Police and Fire Department Titles, Pay Ranges and Career Ladder Steps

PR 5EN	Emergency Communications Operator I					Training Assignments	
Step	1	2	3	4	5	1	2
Hourly	19.47	20.35	21.16	22.01	22.89	23.58	24.28
Biweekly	1,557.72	1,627.82	1,692.93	1,760.65	1,831.07	1,886.01	1,942.59
Annual	40,500.72	42,323.32	44,016.18	45,776.90	47,607.82	49,036.26	50,507.34

PR 5IN	Emergency Communications Operator II						Training Assignments	
Step	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2
Hourly	22.28	23.22	24.21	25.23	26.29	27.40	28.23	29.07
Biweekly	1,782.59	1,857.90	1,936.40	2,018.21	2,103.48	2,192.36	2,258.13	2,325.87
Annual	46,347.34	48,305.40	50,346.40	52,473.46	54,690.48	57,001.36	58,711.38	60,472.62

PR 5IN	Fire Dispatcher					Lead Assignments	
Step	1	2	3	4	5	1	2
Hourly	22.28	23.47	24.71	26.02	27.40	28.23	29.07
Biweekly	1,782.59	1,877.25	1,976.93	2,081.90	2,192.36	2,258.13	2,325.88
Annual	46,347.34	48,808.38	51,400.11	54,129.45	57,001.36	58,711.42	60,472.77

### Police Department – ECO Testing and Training

After the creation of the ECO title in the Milwaukee Police Department (MPD), the Fire and Police Commission (FPC) recruited, tested, and created a new eligible list for the ECO positions. New employees have been hired as an ECO I at the rate of \$40,500 annually. During the first year of employment, an ECO I is trained to perform both the initial MPD call-taking and dispatching functions. In order to pass probation at the end of this first year of employment, an ECO I must satisfactorily pass an on-the-job performance evaluation that encompasses both functions. An ECO I that successfully completes probation is then promoted to the title of ECO II with a starting rate of \$46,347. An ECO II may then advance through the ECO II pay range by meeting the criteria of the career ladder steps.

Prior to the creation of the ECO titles in the Police Department, the Fire and Police Commission conducted separate open competitive exams for candidates to perform either the MPD call-taking (Police Telecommunicator) or the dispatching (Police Dispatcher) responsibilities. MPD dispatchers were in a higher pay range than MPD call-takers. Because new employees were hired from separate eligible lists call-takers interested in dispatching were required to take a competitive examination for dispatching in order to be appointed to that title. In this previous paradigm:

- An MPD call-taker learned how to perform call-taking functions during the probationary year. Thereafter, an employee could advance through the call-taking pay range annually.
- An MPD dispatcher was paid in a higher level pay range during the probationary training year in which they learned how to perform both call-taking and dispatching functions. Thereafter, an employee could advance through the dispatching pay range annually.

### Fire Department – Fire Dispatcher Training

Currently in the Milwaukee Fire Department, the hiring rate for a new Fire Dispatcher is \$46,347 annually. During the first year of employment, a Fire Dispatcher is trained to perform call-taking functions when answering calls transferred from an ECO, as well as the MFD medical dispatch function. In order to pass probation at the end of this first year of employment, a Fire Dispatcher must satisfactorily pass an on-the-job performance evaluation that encompasses both functions. A Fire Dispatcher that successfully passes probation may then advance through the Fire Dispatcher pay range by meeting the criteria of the career ladder steps.

The previous Fire Dispatcher training was very similar to the current approach. During the probationary training year, a new employee learned how to perform both MFD call-taking and dispatching functions. Thereafter, an employee could advance through the pay range annually.

### **Cost of Labor Comparisons**

In reviewing the cost of labor for these positions, staff reviewed the rates of pay for similar positions in surrounding communities. The following chart depicts related cost of labor data in southeastern Wisconsin.

Municipality	Effective	Minimum	Maximum
City of Waukesha	January, 2016	\$51,334	\$58,760
City of Wauwatosa	January, 2016	\$43,326	\$58,056
Waukesha County	July, 2018	\$44,928	\$57,054
<b>City of Milwaukee ECO II</b>	<b>January, 2018</b>	<b>\$46,347</b>	<b>\$57,001</b>
<b>City of Milwaukee Fire Dispatcher</b>	<b>January, 2018</b>	<b>\$46,347</b>	<b>\$57,001</b>
Dane County	November, 2014	\$46,613	\$51,210
<b>City of Milwaukee ECO I</b>	<b>January, 2018</b>	<b>\$40,501</b>	<b>\$47,608</b>
City of Muskego	November, 2014	\$37,232	\$46,592
Kenosha - Joint Services	November, 2014	\$36,816	\$46,120
City of West Allis	January, 2016	\$39,978	\$42,744
Milwaukee County	January, 2016	\$37,357	\$41,995

The Fire and Police Commission has made the decision to conduct a combined recruitment of Police and Fire Department 9-1-1 operators in 2018; and the intent of this report is to recommend a minimum rate that will be the same for a combined title of Police ECO (that are now responsible for both call-taking and dispatching) and Fire Dispatcher.

In considering these market rates of pay, it is also important to take into consideration the volume and complexity of work performed by Milwaukee 9-1-1 operators as compared to other jurisdictions in the Milwaukee metro area. In 2016, the Milwaukee Police Department (MPD) received over 1,000,000 calls of which approximately 600,000 represented 911 calls. This number includes the approximately 155,000 calls that MPD transferred to the Milwaukee Fire Dispatchers. Milwaukee Fire Dispatchers then dispatched department resources to over 93,000 fire and Emergency Medical Service (EMS) incidents, and an additional 77,000 dispatches to private ambulance companies. As part of the department's Shared Services Initiative (in which the MFD works in cooperation with suburban counterparts), MFD responded to 922 out-of-city incidents and requested out-of-city resources on 2,887 calls.

For comparison, in 2014 the Waukesha County Communications Center answered 164,000 phone calls and entered 257,861 calls of service for 23 different municipalities Police and Fire/EMS as well as calls for service for the Waukesha County Sheriff's Department, Police Departments and Fire/EMS Departments.

With this comparison of volume and complexity in mind, the most comparable rates to consider are those paid to operators with the City of Waukesha, City of Wauwatosa, Waukesha County and Dane County.

**Recommendation**

Taking into consideration the cost of labor for 9-1-1 operators in the Milwaukee metro area, this report recommends a hiring rate of \$43,326 for both the ECO and Fire Dispatcher titles. Further, an employee who receives a satisfactory performance assessment at the 6-month point of the probationary period would advance to the rate of \$46,347. Following completion of the probationary period, a 9-1-1 operator would then have the ability to advance through the pay range upon meeting the criteria of the career ladder steps. It is also the intention of the Police and Fire Departments to change the probationary periods for ECO and Fire Dispatcher from one year to 18 months to allow incumbents ample time to learn and demonstrate proficiency.

To accomplish this recommendation, the titles of ECO I and ECO II would be combined into one ECO title. The recommended pay ranges for ECOs and Fire Dispatchers would change as follows:

PR 5IN	Emergency Communications Operator – Call Taking and Dispatch Responsibilities							Training Assignments	
Step	1	2 (6 mos.)	3	4	5	6	7	1	2
Hourly	20.83	22.28	23.22	24.21	25.23	26.29	27.40	28.23	29.07
Biweekly	1,666.38	1,782.59	1,857.90	1,936.40	2,018.21	2,103.48	2,192.36	2,258.13	2,325.87
Annual	43,325.88	46,347.34	48,305.40	50,346.40	52,473.46	54,690.48	57,001.36	58,711.38	60,472.62

PR 5IN	Fire Dispatcher						Lead Assignments	
Step	1	2 (6 mos.)	3	4	5	6	1	2
Hourly	20.83	22.28	23.47	24.71	26.02	27.40	28.23	29.07
Biweekly	1,666.38	1,782.59	1,877.25	1,976.93	2,081.90	2,192.36	2,258.13	2,325.88
Annual	43,325.88	46,347.34	48,808.38	51,400.11	54,129.45	57,001.36	58,711.42	60,472.77

This recommended minimum rate of pay impacts current ECO I incumbents who are on probation. With the implementation of this report, any ECO who has served at least six months as an ECO I and who has performed satisfactorily would be paid \$46,347. An ECO I who has been on probation for less than six months would be paid \$43,326.

Another consideration is rates of pay for Police Department ECO I incumbents who historically have performed only call-taking functions. There are 36 employees who either do not wish to pursue dispatching responsibilities or have not been successful in taking on dispatch responsibilities. To address this situation, this report recommends a footnote that allows these employees to remain within their current pay ranges with career ladder pay progression. No future employees would be added to this provision.

PR 5IN	Emergency Communications Operator – Call-Taking Only					Training Assignments	
Step	1	2	3	4	5	1	2
Hourly	19.47	20.35	21.16	22.01	22.89	23.58	24.28
Biweekly	1,557.72	1,627.82	1,692.93	1,760.65	1,831.07	1,886.01	1,942.59
Annual	40,500.72	42,323.32	44,016.18	45,776.90	47,607.82	49,036.26	50,507.34

**Action Required – Effective Pay Period 15, 2018 (July 15, 2018)**In the Salary Ordinance:

## Under Pay Range 5EN:

Delete the title 'Emergency Communications Operator I' and footnotes (11), (12), and (13).

## Under Pay Range 5IN:

Delete the title 'Emergency Communications Operator II' and footnotes (2), (3), (4), (5), and (6)

Add the title 'Emergency Communications Operator' and add new footnotes (2), (3), (4), (5), and (6)

(2) Appointment at any rate in the range based upon related emergency communications experience and credentials with the approval of Employee Relations.

(3) Career Ladder Position. Minimum recruitment is at \$1,666.38 (\$43,325.88). An Emergency Communications Operator will advance to the appropriate increment in the following range upon certification by the Chief of Police as having attained and maintained at all times the required credentials and demonstrated job performance: \$1,666.38, \$1,782.59, \$1,857.90, \$1,936.40, \$2,018.21, \$2,103.48, \$2,192.36 (\$43,325.88, \$46,347.34, \$48,305.40, \$50,346.40, \$52,473.46, \$54,690.48, \$57,001.36). An Emergency Communications Operator who reaches and remains at step seven for 26 pay periods is eligible to receive a 2% lump sum if they otherwise meet the criteria at or above step seven of the career ladder.

(4) Career Ladder Assignments. An Emergency Communications Operator assigned to training duties by the Chief of Police to be paid at the appropriate increment of \$2,258.13 or \$2,325.87 (\$58,711.38 or \$60,472.62) upon certification by the Chief of Police as having attained and maintained at all times the required credentials and demonstrated job performance. An Emergency Communications Operator assigned to intermittent training duties to be paid an additional 5%.

(5) Career Ladder Assignment. An Emergency Communications Operator assigned to Lead duties by the Chief of Police to be paid at the appropriate increment of \$2,345.83, \$2,469.93 or \$2,600.60 (\$60,991.58, \$64,218.18, or \$67,615.60) upon certification by the Chief of Police as having attained and maintained at all times the required credentials and demonstrated job performance.

(6) Career Ladder Position. The Emergency Communications Operators listed at the end of this footnote will advance to the appropriate increment in the range listed below upon certification by the Chief of Police as having attained and maintained at all times the required credentials and demonstrated job performance: \$1,557.72, \$1,627.82, \$1,692.93, \$1,760.65, \$1,831.07 (\$40,500.72, \$42,323.32, \$44,016.18, \$45,776.90, \$47,607.82) If a listed employee reaches and remains at step five for 26 pay periods, that employee is eligible to receive a 2% lump sum if they otherwise meet the criteria at or above step five of the career ladder. If a listed employee is assigned to training duties by the Chief of Police, that employee is to be paid at the appropriate increment of \$1,886.01 or \$1,942.59 (\$49,036.26 or \$50,507.34) upon certification by the Chief of Police as having attained and maintained at all times the required credentials and demonstrated job performance. A listed employee assigned to intermittent training duties to be paid an additional 5%. Employee with this provision include: Daphynie Barbee-Matthews, Deborah Benavides, Jennifer Boylen, Shemeka Campbell, Sherrel Cannon, Michelle Cowan, Marilyn Dejohnett, Beatriz Ferreira, Tenine Fleck, Katherine Fulfer, Yvonne Gagliano-Williams, Katrina Gardner, David Grycowski, Kristin Gutkowki, Jessica Klos,

Diana Lebron, David Lussier, Elisa Marquez, Margaret Marr, Rose McCulla, Loreal McKinley, Bonnie Muzia, Timeka Parker, Lina Ramirez, Willie Mae Ray, Vanessa Reed, Corliss Shaw, Nicole Sprewer, Regenia Thomas Love, Jamaica Thompson, Aimee Tolefree, Patrice Toliver, Tina Torrez Cruz, Yvonne Williams, Cindy Wirth, Jasmine Words.

Delete footnote (7) from the title 'Fire Dispatcher' and add a new footnote (7) as follows:

(7) Career Ladder Position. Minimum recruitment is at \$1,666.38 (\$43,325.88). A Fire Dispatcher will advance to the appropriate increment in the following range upon certification by the Fire Chief as having attained and maintained at all times the required credentials and demonstrated job performance: \$1,666.38, 1,782.59, 1,877.25, 1,976.93, 2,081.90, 2,192.36 (43,325.88, 46,347.43, 48,808.38, 51,400.11, 54,129.45, 57,001.38). A Fire Dispatcher who reaches and remains at step six for 26 pay periods is eligible to receive a 2% lump sum if they otherwise meet the criteria at or above step six of the career ladder.

In the Positions Ordinance:

Under the Police Department, Technical Communications Division

Delete 135 positions of 'Emergency Communications Operator II' and add 135 positions of 'Emergency Communications Operator'.

Prepared by:   
Andrea Knickerbocker, Human Resources Manager

Reviewed by:   
Maria Monteaquedo, Employee Relations Director