

Special Agenda

Agenda and agenda notes for Special General Body Meeting of Karnataka Evaluation Authority to be held on 30.01.2020 under the Chairmanship of Chief Secretary to Karnataka Government at Room no: 313, Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru 560 001.

Agenda no.	Subject
Agenda-1	Modification of Para 6 of Memorandum of Association of Karnataka Evaluation Authority
Agenda-2	Modification of Rule (4) of Rules Karnataka Evaluation Authority

Agenda Subject -1

Modification to Para 6 of Memorandum of Association of Karnataka Evaluation Authority

The Government vide its order No. PD 170 PSD 2018, Bangalore, dated 01/01/2019 has reconstituted the Governing Body of Karnataka Evaluation Authority. In the reconstituted Governing Body, the treasurer has been omitted. Therefore, it is necessitated to reconstitute the Governing Body. The Governing Body is part of the Memorandum of Association of Karnataka Evaluation Authority and as such the same needs to be modified. As per the provision of The Karnataka Societies Registration Act, 1960 (rule 6, 9 & 10) it is necessary to amend and update the Memorandum of Association to change the composition of the Governing Body. The changes have been approved in the Governing Body and the same is required to be confirmed in the General Body.

It is proposed to replace the existing para 6 of Memorandum of Association as follows:

“6. The members of the Governing Body to whom, by the rules of the Society, the management of its affairs is entrusted, are as shown below:-

Sl. No.	Designation and Address	Designation in the society
1	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Planning, Programme Monitoring & Statistics Department, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	President
2	Chief Evaluation Officer, Karnataka Evaluation Authority, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member Secretary

Sl. No.	Designation and Address	Designation in the society
3	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Finance Department (Expenditure) or nominee, Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
4	ACS / Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms or his nominee, Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
5	Principal Secretary to Government, Rural Development and Panchayat Raj Department, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
6	Director General, Administrative Training Institute, Mysore.	Member
7	Principal Secretary to Government, Women and Child Welfare Department, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
8	Principal Secretary to Government, Health and Family Welfare Department, Vikasa Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
9	Principal Secretary to Government, Social Welfare Department, Vikasa Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
10	Administrative Officer, Karnataka Evaluation Authority, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Treasurer
11	4 nominated members	Member

Subject to above, in addition to the members at Sl.No.1 to 10, for Sl.No.11 the following may be made members of the Governing Body.

- a. Two eminent Academicians with Special knowledge on Evaluation and research methodology nominated by the Chairman.
- b. Any other eminent person with knowledge on Consultancy procurement, evaluation methodology etc. and who can advance the cause of effective evaluation, nominated by the Chairman.

- c. Ex-officio members are members by virtue of their holding a post. No sooner a new incumbent joins a post, he becomes ex-officio member of the society, and the earlier one retires.

Nominated members are at the pleasure of the President, Governing Body”.

As per Section 9 of Karnataka Societies Registration Act, 1960, “Whenever it shall appear to the governing body of any society registered under this Act which has been established for any particular purpose or purposes that it is advisable to alter, extend or abridge such purpose or for other purposes specified in section 3, the governing body may submit the proposition to the members of the society in a written or printed report, and may convene a special general meeting for the consideration thereof according to the rules and regulations of the society”.

Hence, the matter is placed before the Special General Body for approval for Modification to Para 6 of Memorandum of Association of Karnataka Evaluation Authority.

For Approval of the Modification.

Agenda Subject -2

Modification to Rule 4 of Rules of the Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA)

The Government vide its order No. PD/8/EVN (2)/2011, Bangalore, dated 11/07/2011 has approved and issued the Rules and Regulations for the furtherance of the aims and objectives mentioned in the Memorandum of Association of Karnataka Evaluation Authority.

Rule 4 provides for the members of the General Body. It states that the General Body shall consist of not more than 18 members. However, it also retains the founders / promoters as members of the society in addition to 15 officers listed as members apart from providing for nomination of 4 persons as members at the pleasure of the Chairman. This exceeds the General Body number provided. Hence Rule 4 is proposed to be altered as below:

“4. General Body:

- (1) General Body shall consist of not more than nineteen members.

The following will be the members of the Society and will constitute the General Body. The Chief Secretary to Government shall be the Chairman of the General Body. Ex-officio members may be permitted to be represented by their representatives in the General Body and other meetings if they are not able to attend in person. The Chief Evaluation Officer shall be the Member-Secretary of the General Body. The General Body of the Society shall consist of the following members, namely: -

Sl. No.	Designation and Address	Designation in the society
1	Chief Secretary to Government, Government of Karnataka, Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Chairman
2	Additional Chief Secretary & Development Commissioner, Government of Karnataka, Bengaluru-01.	Member
3	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Planning, Programme Monitoring & Statistics Department, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
4	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Finance Department (Expenditure) or nominee, Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
5	Principal Secretary to Government, Rural Development and Panchayat Raj Department, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
6	Director General, Administrative Training Institute, Mysore.	Member
7	Principal Secretary to Government, Health and Family Welfare Department, Vikasa Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
8	The Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Primary & Secondary Education, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
9	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Horticulture Department, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
10	Principal Secretary to Government, Social Welfare Department, Vikasa Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
11	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms or his nominee, Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member
12	Principal Secretary / Secretary to Government, Department of Law, Justice & Human Rights, Vidhan Soudha, Bengaluru-01.	Member

Sl. No.	Designation and Address	Designation in the society
13	Director, Fiscal Policy Institute, Near Panchamukhi Ganesha Temple, Kengeri Post, Bangalore-Mysore Road, Bengaluru-560 060	Member
14	Director, Directorate of Economics & Statistics, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member
15	Chief Evaluation Officer, Karnataka Evaluation Authority, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Member Secretary
16	Administrative Officer, Karnataka Evaluation Authority, M.S. Building, Bengaluru-01.	Treasurer
17	3 nominated members	Member

(2) Subject to sub-para (1) above, the following may be made members of the Society.

- a. Academicians with Special knowledge on Evaluation and research methodology nominated by the Chairman.
- b. Any other eminent person with knowledge on Consultancy procurement, evaluation methodology etc. and who can advance the cause of effective evaluation, nominated by the Chairman.
- c. Representative of the Planning Commission, UNDP, UNICEF nominated by the Chairman.
- d. Retried IAS officers not below the rank of ACS nominated by the Chairman.
- e. Ex-officio members are members by virtue of their holding a post. No sooner a new incumbent joins a post, he becomes ex-officio member of the society, and the earlier one retires.

Nominated members are at the pleasure of the Chairman, General Body.”

As per Section 10 of Karnataka Societies Registration Act, “The name and the Rules and Regulations of a society may be

amended by a resolution passed at a special general meeting convened for the purpose”.

The matter is placed before the Special General Body for approval.

**Agenda notes for 6th Meeting of General Body of
Karnataka Evaluation Authority to be held on
30.01.2020 under the Chairmanship of Chief Secretary
to Karnataka Government in Room Number 313,
Vidhana Soudha, Bengaluru**

Sl. No.	Agenda no.	Subject
1	Agenda-1	Confirmation of the proceedings of the 5 th General Body meeting held on 12-10-2018
2	Agenda-2	Action Taken Report on decisions taken at the 5 th General Body meeting
3	Agenda-3	Progress report of KEA
4	Agenda-4	Audit Report for 2018-19
5	Agenda-5	Budget estimate for 2020-21
6	Agenda-6	Report of Governing Body
7	Agenda-7	Report on Evaluation Studies
8	Agenda-8	Action Taken Reports on the Evaluation Reports
9	Agenda-9	Additional Interventions to Monitor and Improve quality Reports
10	Agenda-10	Any other subjects with permission of the chair

Agenda Subject -1

Confirmation of the proceedings of the 5th meeting of General Body

To read and confirm the proceedings of the 5th meeting of General Body of KEA held on 12th October 2018. Proceedings enclosed as **Annexure-I**.

Agenda Subject -2

Action Taken Report on the decisions taken in the 5th General Body Meeting of KEA

Action Taken Report on the decisions taken in the 5th meeting of General Body of KEA is enclosed as **Annexure-II**.

Agenda Subject -3

Annual Report of KEA

The Annual Report containing KEA initiated activities in 2018-19 as approved in the 18th meeting of Governing Body of KEA is placed before General Body and is enclosed in **Annexure-III**. Progress made by KEA during 2018-19 is broadly highlighted as below:

The details of Evaluation Studies during 2018-19

Evaluation Studies Completed	-13
Evaluation Studies In progress	-29
Evaluation Studies Identified	-21

New Initiatives

I. Internship programme in various departments of Government of Karnataka and at Zilla Panchyat and DC offices

Government of Karnataka has introduced Internship programme in various departments of the Government, Zilla Panchayat and Deputy Commissioners' offices in the District. The programme is co-ordinated by Karnataka Evaluation Authority, Planning Programme Monitoring and Statistics Department, Government of Karnataka. The concerned Department Secretary is the nodal officer for internship program in the respective department. This programme seeks to engage Post Graduate students or Research Scholars

enrolled in recognized University / Institution within India or abroad, as 'Interns'. The students apply online for internship programme along with necessary documents under Seva Sindhu portal. The Interns will be selected on the basis of their eligibility and deputed to concerned Departments. After successful completion of Internship, they submit the project report to the Department which will be reviewed by the concerned Department and graded. Successful interns are awarded completion certificate by KEA based on the satisfactory report from the Concerned Department. 14 students have applied for Internship programme, 5 students have completed and submitted the project report. Certificate of completion of Internship have issued to 3 students. The details are given in **Annexure-IV**.

II. Research and Evaluation-Capacity Building of State Universities

As per the direction of the General Body, KEA is engaging with State Universities in Evaluation studies to enhance their capacities in research and evaluation. The evaluation of "Beti Bachao Beti Padhao" scheme in Vijayapura district is taken through Akkamahadevi Women's University, Vijayapura. Further, out of 50 evaluation studies to be taken up in next coming years, 25 will be done through Universities. Necessary guidelines have been prepared and approved in the 18th Governing Body.

III. Training

To ensure that the recommendations are evidence based and implementable, one day Training Workshop was held on capacity building of the Evaluation Consultant Organizations on 19-08-2019. The Principal Investigators, representatives of the Evaluation Consultant Organisations, Independent Assessors, Officers of Planning Department, etc., participated in the workshop. Around 70 participants registered and participated in the workshop. During Technical Session-I, lectures were given on Data Analysis and Interpretation, Choice and Application of Evaluation Methods and Results Based Evaluation and Monitoring Policy by various subject experts who have been invited for the same. During Technical Session II, officers of KEA gave information on Need for Monitoring & Evaluation, Terms of Reference, Method of Reading Terms of Reference for a Study, Inception Report, Data Analysis and findings, Structure of the Report, Format of the Report, Draft Evaluation Report and its assessment and grading, Final Evaluation Report, Findings and Recommendation and Suggestions, Collection of Primary and Secondary data and Sampling, Kannada Translation of the Evaluation Reports, General Instructions to be adopted by Evaluation Consultant Organizations while preparing & printing the Evaluation Study Reports, Design of Cover Page and inner page. Views and suggestions of the participants were taken in the feedback forms.

IV. Formation of Committee to revise the existing manuals of KEA

As discussed in the 16th Governing Body meeting of Karnataka Evaluation Authority(KEA) held on 16-07-2018, it was noted the changes effected in the staffing pattern, renewal of empanelment of consultant organization, ToR, assessment and grading, RFP document etc and felt that it is necessary to revise the existing four manuals namely., 1) The Human Resource Manual, 2) The Finance and Accounting Manual, 3) The Manual for Empanelment of Evaluation Consultant and 4) The Output grading Manual. It was decided to constitute a sub committee comprising of Finance Department, Law Department and Subject Experts.

Following committee is formed to revise the existing manuals of KEA.

Sl. No.	Designation and Address	Designation
1	Chief Evaluation Officer, Karnataka Evaluation Authority	Chairperson
2	Additional Chief Evaluation Officer, Karnataka Evaluation Authority	Member
3	Nominee of Principal Secretary to Govt. Planning, Programme Monitoring and Statistics Department	Member
4	Nominee of Secretary/Principal Secretary to Government, Finance Department	Member
5	Nominee of Secretary/Principal Secretary to Government, Department	Member

Sl. No.	Designation and Address	Designation
	of Personnel and Administrative Reforms	
6	Nominee of Secretary/Principal Secretary to Government, Law Department	Member
7	Administrative Officer	Member Secretary
8	Subject Experts	Member

V. Formation of Sub committees

It has been decided in the 19th Governing Body held on 03-08-2019 that in order for KEA to be perceived as a think tank, it needs to build its capacity to provide policy inputs to the Government based on a holistic analysis of issues for planning and budgeting new schemes, restructuring the existing schemes, effective beneficiary oriented designs and innovative implementation tools to maximize the welfare outcomes through optimal use of resources. In this context it was decided to form the sub committees of experts in the field as per the requirement. The following sub committees have been formed.

1. Estimation of GSDP
2. Education, Employment and Skill Development
3. Women and Child Development
4. Estimation of Happiness Index for Karnataka.

The details of each committee is at **Annexure – V.**

VI. Strengthening of KEA

It was decided in the 18th Governing Body meeting on 16-05-2019 to recruit to the posts of Director, Associate Director and Research Fellows on contract basis to enable KEA to perform its functions effectively. Paper Notification was published on 18-08-2019 notifying these posts. After due process and interviews held on 22nd and 23rd of October 2019 8 Research Fellows, 4 Associate Directors and 1 Director have selected.

Dr.Manjunath, Asst.Professor, ISEC has joined KEA in the post of Director (Evaluation) on deputation basis on 31-08-2019.

VII. KEA participation

KEA is supporting Planning, Programme Monitoring and Statistics Department (PPMS) in preparing the status report and formulating strategies for attainment of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Karnataka by 2030.

- KEA has supported the other Initiatives of NITI Aayog- India Innovation Index, Ease of Doing Business Index, Ease of Living Index etc.
- KEA has also supported the preparation of the Karnataka State Human Development Report and involved in preparation of BBMP Human Development Report.

- KEA is also co-ordinating on Transformation of Raichur and Yadgir Aspirational Districts in Karnataka.
- KEA is also supporting the data analytics for effective scheme implementation and policy formulation through CODR.

VIII. Monitoring of Evaluation Studies

- Review Meetings are held every month to review the progress of studies conducted by Evaluation Consultant Organisation. Seven review meetings were held during the period.
- Random Sampling is being done by KEA.
- Presentation of inception reports before KEA for approval.
- Action taken reports for the recommendations made are being monitored by a committee under the chairmanship of the Principal Secretary, PPMS department and is being reviewed in the KDP meeting.

The above is placed before the General Body for information.

Agenda Subject -4

Audit Report for 2018-19

Annual accounts of KEA for the financial year 2018-19 is prepared and has been audited by the CAG Empanelled Chartered Accountant M/s MKPS & Associates, Bangalore. The audit report on the receipts and payments statement, the balance sheet and notes on accounts were placed in the 18th meeting of the Governing Body of KEA (for approval to be placed before the General Body in accordance with rule 14(3) of the Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA) rules 2011). The Governing Body has examined the audit report and approved for placing before the ensuing General Body.

Accordingly, the statutory audit report for 2018-19 along with Income and Expenditure statement, Assets and Liabilities is enclosed as **Annexure-VI**.

The Audit Report is placed before the General Body for approval.

Agenda Subject -5

Budget requirement for the year 2020-21

Sl. No.	Head of account	No	Amount required in Rupees
I	2515-00-101-0-26-101 (Salaries)		3,57,08,412
II	2515-00-103-0-26-103 (General)		
a	Schemes Evaluation ongoing	26	2,00,00,000
b	New schemes Tendered in 2019-20 and continued	5	3,95,00,000
c	New schemes for 2020-21	25	6,25,00,000
d	Office expenses (postage, phone, meeting, advertisement, stationery, Furniture & fixtures)		35,00,000
e	Publication /Training/In house Resource		25,00,000
f	Decision Support System(2020-21)		1,05,98,807
g	Sustainable Development Goals & Aspirational Districts		32,70,000
	a) Salary for 2 Consultants: 1980000		
	b) Meeting & chapter writer : 1290000		
h	Payment to CODR		4,91,60,000
i	Payment to SDGCC (UNDP)		3,94,29,085
	Total (II)		23,04,57,892
	Grand total (salaries & General) (I+II)		26,61,66,304

Budget for 2020-21 is placed before the General Body for approval.

Agenda Subject – 6

Report of Governing Body

Proceedings of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th meeting of the Governing Body of KEA held on 05-01-2019, 16-05-2019, 03-08-2019 and 03-12-2019 respectively are enclosed in **Annexure-VII**. The important decisions taken by the Governing Body are as follows:

17th Meeting of Governing Body

- i. Decided that availability and provision of data by the concerned Line Department should be made as precondition for taking up the study from that Department.
- ii. Persued the amendment to 'Request for Proposal (RFP)' to have a control on the pendency of studies by ECOs and suggested to specify the 'pending' word in the sentence at the Draft Evaluation Report submission stage 'on account of reasons attributable to ECO'.
- iii. The amendment of clause 9b(ii) and 9b(iii) of the MoU in the light of observations made by the AG.
- iv. Approval for Development of KEA portal by calling tender for selection of Application Service Provider.
- v. Approval to levy penalty of 1% of the total evaluation cost if Kannada reports are not in acceptable form and if 10% omissions/defects are noticed in the content material.

- vi. Approval to conduct training programme and workshop for ECOs and officers of Line Departments by introducing topics like result based monitoring and evaluation, evidence-based policy making etc., in training programmes/workshops.

18th Meeting of Governing Body

- i. Approval for guidelines framed for conducting evaluation studies through Indian Universities & Research Institutions.
- ii. Approval for cancellation of the tender invited for selection of service provider for Design, Development, Deployment and Maintenance of KEA Portal.
- iii. Approval for revision of RFP proposal with inclusion of conditions that the ECO should enter the financial cost for all the nine criteria given in the table 4B of financial proposal which is mandatory and Evaluation team proposed for the study has to include a Kannada translator as member is mandatory.
- iv. Approval for Extension of the services of Sri.Dinesha S, as consultant (T &T) for the period of one year i.e., upto 22-07-2020.
- v. Approval for empanelment of the following five Consultant Organizations and two Independent Assessors with KEA.

Detail list of Empanelled ECOs & IAs (from 12-10-2018 to 31-08-2019)

Sl. no.	Name of the ECO	Empanelment details
Evaluation Consultant Organizations:		
1	CRISIL Risk & Infrastructure Solutions Ltd. CRISIL House, Central Avenue, Hiranandani, Business Park, Powai-Mumbai 400 076	10 th empanelment committee held on 14-05-2019
2	Karnataka Institute of Public Auditors, The Alumini Association of UVCE, Silver Jubilee Building, K.R. Circle-Bengaluru	
3	Peaceful Living with Unified Solutions, #320, ‘Vihaan’, 1 st Main, Talakaveri Layout, Amruthahalli, Bengaluru-560092.	
4	Research and Development Centre, Acharya Institute of Graduate Studies of JMJ Education Society, Acharya Dr. Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan Road, Soldevanahalli-Bengaluru- 560 107	
5	Research n Consulting, S-26, Golden Enclave, Old Airport Road-Bengaluru-560 017	
Independent Assessors:		
1	K. Rajendra Prasad, #6, Sri Sai Dhama, Divine City, M.G. Road, Chikballapur-562 101.	
2	Dr. Subramanian K.V # 402, 2 nd Main, Canara Bank Layout, Kodigehalli, Bengaluru- 560 097.	
Evaluation Consultant Organizations:		
1	SECON Private Ltd. # 147, 7B Road, EPIP, Whitefield, Bengaluru-560 066.	11 th empanelment committee held on 30-08-2019

- vi. Approval for the proposal collaboration between KEA and ATI, Mysuru for conducting evaluation studies.
- vii. Approval for recruitment to the positions of Director and Associate Director(Procurement and Co-ordination Division), Director and Associate Director(Evaluation

Division and Director and Associate Director (Publication and Statistics Division) and Research Fellows in KEA.

19th Meeting of Governing Body

- i. Directed to initiate and fill up the posts as approved in the 18th Governing Body. Pay scales to the officers of KEA and staff working temporarily in KEA are to be paid as per the G.O. PDS 36 PSD 2019, dated:04-07-2019.
- ii. Approved the revision of eligibility criteria for appointment to various posts in KEA.
- iii. Approved the Reservation of Posts in KEA for SC, ST and OBC and under Article 371J for appointment of permanent posts.
- iv. Approved the revision of delegation of Administrative and Financial powers to officers of KEA as amended vide FD 03 TFP 2018, dated:14-05-2018.
- v. Approved to appoint Dr.Chaya K Degaonkar as Additional Chief Evaluation Officer(ACEO) with a honorarium of Rs1,50,000 with 5% annual increase for a period of 3 years.
- vi. Approved the appointment of Administrative Officer of KEA as Honorary Treasurer in the place of Director(ADB) who is now not the member of restricted Governing Body.
- vii. Approved to replace the existing Para 6 Of Memorandum of Association(MoA).
- viii. Approved the modification of Rule 4 of rules of KEA.

- ix. Approved the proposal of calling for Request for Proposal(RFP) for five schemes under QCBS method of KTPP Act.
- x. Approved to form a committee to monitor the process and review the action taken reports from the line department.

20th Meeting of Governing Body

- i. Approved Budget requirement for the year 2020-21.
- ii. Approved the list of 45 studies to be taken up by KEA.
- iii. Approved the selection of 8 Research Fellows, 4 Associate Directors and 1 Director.
- iv. Approved the proposal of calling for Request for Proposal (RFP) for 2 Schemes under QCBS method of KTPP Act.
- v. Approved amendment for Request for Proposal tender document.

The above decisions and Proceedings of the Governing Body are placed for information and approval.

Agenda Subject -7

Report on Evaluation Studies

Since inception KEA has conducted 131 evaluation studies through Evaluation Consultant Organizations. The studies have focused on Women's issues, livelihood and natural resources. Evaluation of schemes promoting human development are getting focus in recent years. Women and Child development Department has more number of studies. Two studies with technical support from foreign universities. A study Haas School of Business, University of California, Berkley.

Table with finalized/on going evaluation studies for the year 2018-19 and 2019-20, various stages are shown in **Annexure-VIII**.

Agenda Subject -8

Action Taken Reports on the Evaluation Reports

As per the decision of the 19th Governing Body meeting held on 03-08-2019, a Committee has been constituted under the Chairpersonship of Principal Secretary to Government, to review Action Taken Reports on Evaluation Studies vide G.O.No. PD 66 PSD 2019, dated:06-09-2019.

The first meeting of the committee was held on 13-09-2019 and the action taken by the Departments was reviewed. The departments who have not submitted the ATRs have been

instructed to submit report on the action taken on recommendations of the Evaluation studies.

Details of action taken on the recommendations of the Evaluation reports is given at **Annexure-IX**.

The subject is placed before this General Body for kind information.

Agenda Subject -9

Additional Interventions to Monitor and Improve quality Reports

Additional Interventions for quality enhancement:-

1. Experts list for seeking guidance at various levels of studies.
2. Reviews Meetings at various stages of the study are held with Consultants Organisations and the concerned departments.
3. Presentation of Interim Report and Draft Evaluation Report before KEA.
4. Preliminary Meetings with ECO and department before commencement of the studies.
5. Changes in RFP documents to get good quality organisations for the study.

Website Migration to new location completed and all the details have been uploaded to the website

Agenda Subject -10

Any other subject with permission of the chair.