



SOUTHAMPTON CITY COUNCIL

TENDER EVALUATION REPORT (PROCUREMENT)

for

**Pitched ROOFING Programme
across the City.**

Prepared by: Andy Verner

Date: 13th March 2020.

1. PROJECT DETAILS

ITEM	DETAILS
Contract Description:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Name: Capital Roofing Maintenance Programme • Nature: The renewal of pitched roof coverings “in kind”, including the repair of the roof structure and decking and insulation as required, and including all temporary works required. All in compliance with current Building Regulations. • Given the scale of the Works to be delivered a combination of addresses shall be carried out concurrently, and the Contractor shall resource accordingly. • Location: City wide. • Length of contract: 156 weeks.
Form of Contract:	The contract is to be awarded under the JCT Intermediate Building Contract with Contractors Design 2011 (ICD) with Amendment 1 (issued March 2015).
Pre-Tender Estimate:	Pre tender estimate for the Initial Works to be awarded upon a 3 year contract (revised post tender to reflect adjusted scope of Works outside of QS knowledge), £3,020,000. It is anticipated that the whole of the pitched re-roofing works shall total a spend of c. £1.5M – £2.25M / annum, i.e to include properties not listed to date, within the above £3,020,000.
Minimum Insurance Requirements:	Employers Liability - £10m (limit of liability any one event). Public/Products Liability - £10m (limit of liability any one event). Professional Indemnity - £2m (limit of liability in any one event).

Contract Period:	156 weeks Works contract and umbrella Framework is for 3 years plus a year extension. Works are divided into 3 sections. LADs apply.
Procurement Process:	Published as an Open Tender on OJEU, Contracts Finder and the Curtis Fitch E-procurement portal on the 5 th December 2019 with a return date of 17 th January 2020 (extended to the 24 th January).
Response:	6 bidders
Evaluation Date:	Quality evaluation 30 th January 2020. Procurement report received 26 th February 2020.

2. QUALITY EVALUATION PANEL MEMBERS

- Des Brown (Building Surveyor) – Project Lead
- Mark Cox (Building Surveyor)
- Paul Middleton (Senior Lift Design Engineer)
- *Project QS – Andy Verner (not in attendance)*

3. TENDER SUBMISSION SUMMARY

3.1 Declarations of Conflict of Interest forms were circulated ahead of the Evaluation Panel meeting. Signed copies were returned by all with no issues arising.

Six bids were received.

The initial tender bids received were as follows:-

- ✓ Avonside Group Services Ltd (£3,185,286.00)
- ✓ AYM (Services) Ltd (£3,459,416.77)
- ✓ Breyer Group plc (£2,945,000.00)
- ✓ Cade Roofing & Building Services Ltd (£3,034,643.48)
- ✓ KSD Support Services Ltd (£6,631,447.35)
- ✓ M & J Group (Construction & Roofing) Ltd (£2,735,804.16)

3.2 The Project QS was provided with a copy of all submissions to enable an

independent assessment of the tendered prices whilst the Evaluation Panel reviewed the quality submissions. This resulted in requests for further clarifications (41 in total) around costs and guarantees from all bidders, all administered via Procurement to ensure bidders were pricing on a “like-for-like” basis.

Tender Sum Analysis

- 3.3 An arithmetic check was made of all tenderers and adjustments are reflected above. Given the 3 year contract period there was no apparent “front end loading” of the earlier years’ works. M&J corrected their tendered price rather than stood by their prices, which is re-assuring in that the tender price isn’t artificially low, while other tenderers absorbed the price increase standing by their tender. AYM and Breyer’s tender for Church View appears artificially low on an individual address basis. There are no concerns.

Service Quality Questionnaire

- 3.4 Following receipt of all service quality responses, the Evaluation Panel members concluded that they were satisfied with the responses received from the M & J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd, Breyer Group, Avonside Group Services, AYM Services & Cade; though each would require following through as noted below.

In the case of **KSD Support Services** however, the conclusion was that they should not be considered any further for the following reasons:-

Professional Qualification & Accreditations – Mandatory Requirement not evidenced;

Professional Qualification & Accreditations – Mandatory Requirement not evidenced;

Their service quality score did not achieve the minimum score of 60% (of the available maximum of 30%).

Des Brown is to revisit any significant issues identified within the Service Quality Questionnaire submissions of all selected contractors with a view to mitigating any perceived risks and 'banking' all stated commitments as contractual obligations, to include:-

- ✓ following up on the mandatory issues identified in 4.2 and 4.3 above;
- ✓ ensuring that all appropriate valid insurances are in place;
- ✓ ensuring that DBS checks are being correctly administered;
- ✓ ensuring all appropriate risk mitigation measures have been reviewed and are in place.

Audited Accounts

- 3.5 SCC Finance have provided financial reports upon all of the Framework suppliers. M&J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd satisfy SCC financial requirements to be awarded the initial 3 year contract works. SCC may require a performance bond or to decline the selected Framework supplier's tenders at the time of any future tendering under the Framework, dependant upon their commercial situation at the time.

Programme

- 3.6 Des Brown to review M&J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd's programme to ensure that there are no substantive issues that would result in non compliance in respect to the contract programme for the delivery of the Works.

Revised Tender Bids

- 3.7 Following receipt of the clarification responses on costs, the revised tender bids were as follows:-

Avonside Group Services Ltd (£3,177,219.00)

AYM (Services) Ltd (£3,451,319.67)

Breyer Group plc (£2,945,000.00)

Cade Roofing & Building Services Ltd (£3,145,643.58)

KSD Support Services Ltd (£6,631,447.35)

M & J Group (Construction & Roofing) Ltd (£2,752,447.16)

4. TENDER EVALUATION RESULTS

The six service quality submissions were therefore assessed and scored individually by each of the 3 Evaluation Panel members; with the scores being aggregated and averaged.

The result of this assessment was then combined with the cost score in full accordance with the stated evaluation criteria to deliver the following result:-

Company	Cost Score (70%)	Quality Score (30%)	Combined Score
M & J Group Constructn & Roofing Ltd	70.00	24.11	94.11
Breyer Group	65.42	22.93	88.35
Avonside Group Services	60.64	21.38	82.02
AYM (Services)	55.83	26.05	81.88
Cade Roofing & Building Services	61.25	20.14	81.39
KSD Support Services	29.05	14.47 *	43.35

The winning bidder for the “Initial Works”, M&J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd had submitted a tendered price (once corrected) of £2,752,447.16; around £267,773 (8.85%) less than the pre-tender estimate of £3,020,000.

The tender documents stated that the service quality element of the bid must achieve a minimum score of 60% (of the available 30%) of the score in order to be a compliant tender. M & J Group’s service quality score met this requirement with 80.35% of the available quality score. All of the other bidders (with the exception of KSD Support Services) also met this requirement.

The full assessment of each of the cost submissions has been completed including the effect of any errors and/or anomalies. Having completed all cost and quality assessments, the final outcome was deemed to be as follows:-

Primary Contractor for delivering the Core Programme of Work (“Initial Works”)

M & J Group (Construction & Roofing) Ltd*

Supporting Framework

Breyer Group plc*
Avonside Group Services Ltd*
AYM Services Ltd;
Cade Roofing & Building Services Ltd*

* *Provisional appointments; subject to meeting the requirements of 4.2 & 4.3 above.*

5. DUE DILIGENCE

All parties were satisfied with the results of the evaluation as recorded within Procurement's report, subject to any remaining issues.

6. CONTRACT DOCUMENTS

Andy Verner to liaise with Legal Services with a view to compiling and formalising the contract with M&J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd (supporting with PO requisitions); and the framework appointments.

7. NEXT STEPS

Upon the satisfactory conclusion of all remaining due diligence, confirmation that M&J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd should be recommended as the successful contractor for the core programme of work ("Initial Works") and confirmation of the five selected contractors (inc. M&J Group Construction and Roofing Ltd) to the supporting framework, Procurement shall issue 'standstill letters' to the unsuccessful bidder, KSD Group.

Upon the approval of the Property Division Tender Report, and upon receiving confirmation of the start and completion dates, Procurement shall arrange the publishing of the formal Contract Award Notices on the OJEU and Contracts Finder, and update SCC's Supplier Management Database (Contract Register).

Appendix 'A'

Recommended by: (to be completed by the full Evaluation Team following consultation with leaseholders).

Name:	Des Brown
Title:	Building Surveyor
Signature:	
Date:	
Name:	Mark Cox
Title:	Senior Building Surveyor
Signature:	
Date:	
Name:	Paul Middleton
Title:	Senior Lift Design Engineer
Signature:	
Date:	
Name:	Andy Verner
Title:	Senior Cost Manager
Signature:	
Date:	

Supported by SRO: (to be completed by the Client)

Name:	Ola Onabajo
Title:	Service Manager (Asset Management)
Signature:	
Date:	

